



ADDENDUM NO. 7

**Selection Review Committee Minutes and Recommendations
Thursday, October 6, 2022**

REQUEST FOR QUALIFICATIONS

**PART A: PRE-SITE RESTORATION SERVICES and
PART B: SITE RESTORATION SERVICES (Construction Management at Risk)**

**Orphaned Well Site Remediation and Restoration Management – Shreveport District with Option
for Federal Well Sites in Lafayette District**
Project No. 431-PA23-002

October 10, 2022

**MINUTES OF THE
INTERVIEWS AND FINAL SCORING OF
SRMAR SELECTION REVIEW COMMITTEE**

**Griffon Room
LaSalle Building – 1st Floor
617 North 3rd St., Baton Rouge, Louisiana**

LDNR Project No's 431-PA23-001 & 431-PA23-002

A meeting of the selection review committee to conduct interviews and recommend to the Louisiana Department of Natural Resources (LDNR) its final scoring of responsive proposers for the above referenced projects was held in the Griffon Room, LaSalle Building – 1st Floor, 617 North 3rd Street, Baton Rouge, Louisiana 70802 on October 10, 2022.

The meeting was called to order at 8:15 a.m. by Mark Moses, selection review committee member. Those committee members present were: Mark Moses, Quinn Gianfala, Megan Terrell, Dirk Thibodeaux, and Charles Bradbury.

The first item of business was to enter into executive session for interviews. There was a motion by Mr. Thibodeaux to go into executive session for interviews, which was seconded by Mr. Bradbury. All committee members agreed to enter executive session.

Interviews during the executive session were as follows:

- 8:30 a.m. – 9:00 a.m. ESGIS
- 9:00 a.m. – 9:30 a.m. LORA
- 9:30 a.m. – 10:00 a.m. Dynamic Group
- 10:20 a.m. – 10:29 a.m. Elm Springs
- 10: 45 a.m. – 11:16 a.m. Garner Env. Serv. Group
- 11:17 a.m. – 11:41 a.m. Brizo Construction Group
- 11:45 a.m. – 12:15 p.m. Lemoine Group

The committee reconvened at 2:06 p.m. by unanimous vote on a motion by Mr. Thibodeaux and seconded by Ms. Terrell.

The next item on the agenda was to present the committee's scoring of the proposers. On a motion by Mr. Moses and seconded by Ms. Terrell, the committee voted unanimously to find that Elm Springs was disqualified as its proposal sought only to perform Part B of the LDNR Project No. 431-PA23-001 and was therefore not a responsive proposal.

Next, Mr. Moses asked Mr. Blake Canfield of LDNR to read the committee's total score and ranking of each remaining proposer for LDNR Project No. 431-PA23-001. Mr. Canfield, then read out the below total scores of each of the proposing firms and their final rank for this project with the lowest total score being ranked first, i.e. best. Attached are copies of the selection committee member's score sheets for Project No. 431-PA23-001 on which the below listed totals and ranks are based.

<u>Rank</u>	<u>Firm</u>	<u>Total Score</u>
1	Dynamic Group	97
2	Lemoine Group	149
3	Brizo Construction Group	180
4	Garner Env. Serv. Group	202
5	ESGIS	245
6	LORA	274
7	Elm Springs	DQ

The selection committee then unanimously moved, on a motion by Mr. Bradbury and seconded by Mr. Thibodeaux, to recommend that the Secretary of LDNR consider the selection committee's above score and ranking of proposing firms in selecting the SRMR for Project No. 431-PA23-001.

Mr. Moses asked Mr. Canfield to read the committee's total score and ranking of each proposer for LDNR Project No. 431-PA23-002. Mr. Canfield, then read out the below total scores of each of the proposing firms and their final rank for this project with the lowest total score being ranked first, i.e. best. Attached are copies of the selection committee member's score sheets for Project No. 431-PA23-002 on which the below listed totals and ranks are based.

<u>Rank</u>	<u>Firm</u>	<u>Total Score</u>
1	Dynamic Group	97
2	Lemoine Group	147
3	Brizo Construction Group	180
4	Garner Env. Serv. Group	252
5	ESGIS	322
6	LORA	336

The selection committee then unanimously moved, on a motion by Mr. Thibodeaux and seconded by Mr. Bradbury, to recommend that the Secretary of LDNR consider the selection committee's above score and ranking of proposing firms in selecting the SRMR for Project No. 431-PA23-002.

Next, the selection committee, asked for any public comments. Mr. Louis Banos asked for an explanation of the scoring. Mr. Canfield said that the selection committee members scored each proposing firm on the basis of the categories for review listed in the RFQs and that those scores were added together to come up with the total score and the ranking. Mr. Jason Bruzik, with P&N on contract to LDNR, further explained that the lower the score the higher the ranking and provided an example showing that the company with the lowest total score was first recommended.

Mr. Andre LeBlanc asked what the next steps were and when would LDNR make a selection. Mr. Canfield stated that LDNR planned to make a selection for both projects and announcement of such selections no later than Monday, October 10, 2022.

There were no further comments.

The meeting was adjourned at 2:37 p.m.

SCORE SHEET BALLOT NAME MARK MOSES *Mark Moses*
 LDNR Project No. 431-PA23-002 – Shreveport District
 Orphaned Well Site Remediation and Restoration Management

- Following interviews of each responsive proposer, the Selection Review Committee Members will score each interviewed proposer as follows based on their written proposal and interview in each of the categories set forth in the RFQ.
- Each Selection Review Committee member is to score proposers on each of the subcategories of the four categories, by ranking each proposer in each subcategory. Scoring/ranking will be in ascending order with the lowest total score representing the best score (i.e. for each category best proposer = 1 point, second best = 2 points, etc).
- The scores by subcategory from all Selection Review Committee members will then be added together with the lowest score being ranked first for each category and the other proposals being ranked with the next lowest score being ranked second, and so on. Rankings for each category will then be added and the lowest overall score will be recommended for the Part A: Pre-site Restoration Services Contract award for the above referenced project.

History, organization, financial condition of firm and its team

	Lemoine	Brizo Const.	Dynamic Group	ESG Integrated Solutions	Garner Env. Services	LORA, Inc.
Business organization & history - RANK	1	3	2	6	4	5
Organizational structure - RANK	1	3	2	4	5	6
Financial condition & bonding capacity - RANK	2	1	3	5	4	6
Capacity to manage the volume & complexity of work - RANK	3	2	1	4	5	6
RANK (TOTAL)	7	9	8	19	18	23

Qualifications and staffing plan

	Lemoine	Brizo Const.	Dynamic Group	ESG Integrated Solutions	Garner Env. Services	LORA, Inc.
Experience of key personnel - RANK	3	2	1	5	4	6
Pre-site restoration phase staffing plans - RANK	1	3	2	5	4	6
Site-restoration phase staffing plans - RANK	2	4	1	5	3	6
RANK (TOTAL)	6	9	4	15	11	18

Approach and methodology

	Lemoine	Brizo Const.	Dynamic Group	ESG Integrated Solutions	Garner Env. Services	LORA, Inc.
Management Approach – Rank	1	3	2	4	5	6
Consistency of proposal with Key Project Values – RANK	3	4	1	2	5	6
Project organization – RANK	1	4	2	3	5	6
Experience with innovative delivery & procurement strategies – RANK	3	4	2	1	5	6
Unique capabilities/resources – RANK	1	4	2	3	5	6
RANK (TOTAL)	9	19	9	13	25	30

Past Performance on Similar Projects

	Lemoine	Brizo Const.	Dynamic Group	ESG Integrated Solutions	Garner Env. Services	LORA, Inc.
Experience on similar projects – RANK	5	4	3	1	2	6
Breadth of locations and types of similar projects – RANK	4	6	2	1	3	5
Customer satisfaction on similar projects – RANK	–	–	–	–	–	–
RANK (TOTAL)	9	10	5	2	5	11

OVERALL RANK/SCORE

	Lemoine	Brizo Const.	Dynamic Group	ESG Integrated Solutions	Garner Env. Services	LORA, Inc.
TOTAL SCORE – Combined Category Ranks	31	47	26	49	59	82
FINAL RANKING	2	3	1	4	5	6

SCORE SHEET BALLOT NAME Justin J. Liampola
 LDNR Project No. 431-PA23-002 – Shreveport District
 Orphaned Well Site Remediation and Restoration Management

- Following interviews of each responsive proposer, the Selection Review Committee Members will score each interviewed proposer as follows based on their written proposal and interview in each of the categories set forth in the RFQ.
- Each Selection Review Committee member is to score proposers on each of the subcategories of the four categories, by ranking each proposer in each subcategory. Scoring/ranking will be in ascending order with the lowest total score representing the best score (i.e. for each category best proposer = 1 point, second best = 2 points, etc).
- The scores by subcategory from all Selection Review Committee members will then be added together with the lowest score being ranked first for each category and the other proposals being ranked with the next lowest score being ranked second, and so on. Rankings for each category will then be added and the lowest overall score will be recommended for the Part A: Pre-site Restoration Services Contract award for the above referenced project.

History, organization, financial condition of firm and its team

	Lemoine	Brizo Const.	Dynamic Group	ESG Integrated Solutions	Garner Env. Services	LORA, Inc.
Business organization & history - RANK	1	1	1	1	1	1
Organizational structure - RANK	1	1	1	1	1	1
Financial condition & bonding capacity - RANK	1	1	1	1	1	1
Capacity to manage the volume & complexity of work - RANK	1	1	1	1	1	1
RANK (TOTAL)	4	4	4	4	4	4

Qualifications and staffing plan

	Lemoine	Brizo Const.	Dynamic Group	ESG Integrated Solutions	Garner Env. Services	LORA, Inc.
Experience of key personnel - RANK	1	1	1	2	2	2
Pre-site restoration phase staffing plans - RANK	1	2	1	3	3	2
Site-restoration phase staffing plans - RANK	1	2	1	3	3	2
RANK (TOTAL)	3	5	3	8	8	6

Approach and methodology

	Lemoine	Brizo Const.	Dynamic Group	ESG Integrated Solutions	Garner Env. Services	LORA, Inc.
Management Approach – Rank	1	2	1	2	3	3
Consistency of proposal with Key Project Values – RANK	2	3	2	2	3	3
Project organization – RANK	2	2	2	3	3	3
Experience with innovative delivery & procurement strategies – RANK	1	2	1	4	3	3
Unique capabilities/resources – RANK	2	1	2	4	3	3
RANK (TOTAL)	8	10	8	16	15	15

Past Performance on Similar Projects

	Lemoine	Brizo Const.	Dynamic Group	ESG Integrated Solutions	Garner Env. Services	LORA, Inc.
Experience on similar projects – RANK	2	1	1	3	2	3
Breadth of locations and types of similar projects – RANK	2	1	1	3	3	3
Customer satisfaction on similar projects – RANK	_____					
RANK (TOTAL)	4	2	2	6	5	6

OVERALL RANK/SCORE

	Lemoine	Brizo Const.	Dynamic Group	ESG Integrated Solutions	Garner Env. Services	LORA, Inc.
TOTAL SCORE – Combined Category Ranks	19	21	17	34	32	31
FINAL RANKING	2	3	1	6	5	4

SCORE SHEET BALLOT NAME Megan Terrell
 LDNR Project No. 431-PA23-002 – Shreveport District
 Orphaned Well Site Remediation and Restoration Management

- Following interviews of each responsive proposer, the Selection Review Committee Members will score each interviewed proposer as follows based on their written proposal and interview in each of the categories set forth in the RFQ.
- Each Selection Review Committee member is to score proposers on each of the subcategories of the four categories, by ranking each proposer in each subcategory. Scoring/ranking will be in ascending order with the lowest total score representing the best score (i.e. for each category best proposer = 1 point, second best = 2 points, etc).
- The scores by subcategory from all Selection Review Committee members will then be added together with the lowest score being ranked first for each category and the other proposals being ranked with the next lowest score being ranked second, and so on. Rankings for each category will then be added and the lowest overall score will be recommended for the Part A: Pre-site Restoration Services Contract award for the above referenced project.

History, organization, financial condition of firm and its team

	Lemoine	Brizo Const.	Dynamic Group	ESG Integrated Solutions	Garner Env. Services	LORA, Inc.
Business organization & history - RANK	1	2	3	6	4	5
Organizational structure - RANK	2	3	1	5	4	6
Financial condition & bonding capacity - RANK	2	1	3	6	4	5
Capacity to manage the volume & complexity of work - RANK	1	3	2	6	4	5
RANK (TOTAL)	6	9	9	23	16	21

Qualifications and staffing plan

	Lemoine	Brizo Const.	Dynamic Group	ESG Integrated Solutions	Garner Env. Services	LORA, Inc.
Experience of key personnel - RANK	2	3	1	5	4	6
Pre-site restoration phase staffing plans - RANK	2	3	1	6	4	5
Site-restoration phase staffing plans - RANK	2	3	1	4	5	6
RANK (TOTAL)	4	9	3	15	13	17

Approach and methodology

	Lemoine	Brizo Const.	Dynamic Group	ESG Integrated Solutions	Garner Env. Services	LORA, Inc.
Management Approach – Rank	2	3	1	6	4	5
Consistency of proposal with Key Project Values – RANK	2	4	1	5	3	6
Project organization – RANK	2	4	1	5	3	6
Experience with innovative delivery & procurement strategies – RANK	2	4	1	5	3	6
Unique capabilities/resources – RANK	2	4	1	5	3	6
RANK (TOTAL)	10	19	5	26	16	29

Past Performance on Similar Projects

	Lemoine	Brizo Const.	Dynamic Group	ESG Integrated Solutions	Garner Env. Services	LORA, Inc.
Experience on similar projects – RANK	2	3	1	6	4	5
Breadth of locations and types of similar projects – RANK	3	4	1	6	2	5
Customer satisfaction on similar projects – RANK	_____					
RANK (TOTAL)	5	7	2	12	6	10

OVERALL RANK/SCORE

	Lemoine	Brizo Const.	Dynamic Group	ESG Integrated Solutions	Garner Env. Services	LORA, Inc.
TOTAL SCORE – Combined Category Ranks	25	44	19	76	51	77
FINAL RANKING	2	3	1	5	4	6

SCORE SHEET BALLOT NAME DICK
 LDNR Project No. 431-PA23-002 – Shreveport District
 Orphaned Well Site Remediation and Restoration Management

- Following interviews of each responsive proposer, the Selection Review Committee Members will score each interviewed proposer as follows based on their written proposal and interview in each of the categories set forth in the RFQ.
- Each Selection Review Committee member is to score proposers on each of the subcategories of the four categories, by ranking each proposer in each subcategory. Scoring/ranking will be in ascending order with the lowest total score representing the best score (i.e. for each category best proposer = 1 point, second best = 2 points, etc).
- The scores by subcategory from all Selection Review Committee members will then be added together with the lowest score being ranked first for each category and the other proposals being ranked with the next lowest score being ranked second, and so on. Rankings for each category will then be added and the lowest overall score will be recommended for the Part A: Pre-site Restoration Services Contract award for the above referenced project.

History, organization, financial condition of firm and its team

	Lemoine	Brizo Const.	Dynamic Group	ESG Integrated Solutions	Garner Env. Services	LORA, Inc.
Business organization & history - RANK	1	2	4	6	3	5
Organizational structure - RANK	2	3	1	6	4	5
Financial condition & bonding capacity - RANK	2	1	3	6	4	5
Capacity to manage the volume & complexity of work - RANK	3	2	1	6	4	5
RANK (TOTAL)	8	8	9	24	15	20

Qualifications and staffing plan

	Lemoine	Brizo Const.	Dynamic Group	ESG Integrated Solutions	Garner Env. Services	LORA, Inc.
Experience of key personnel - RANK	4	2	1	6	3	5
Pre-site restoration phase staffing plans - RANK	4	1	2	6	3	5
Site-restoration phase staffing plans - RANK	5	2	1	6	4	5
RANK (TOTAL)	13	5	4	18	10	15

Approach and methodology

	Lemoine	Brizo Const.	Dynamic Group	ESG Integrated Solutions	Garner Env. Services	LORA, Inc.
Management Approach – Rank	3	2	1	6	5	4
Consistency of proposal with Key Project Values – RANK	3	2	1	6	4	5
Project organization – RANK	3	2	1	6	4	5
Experience with innovative delivery & procurement strategies – RANK	3	2	1	6	4	5
Unique capabilities/resources – RANK	5	2	1	6	3	4
RANK (TOTAL)	17	10	5	30	20	23

Past Performance on Similar Projects

	Lemoine	Brizo Const.	Dynamic Group	ESG Integrated Solutions	Garner Env. Services	LORA, Inc.
Experience on similar projects – RANK	3	2	1	6	5	4
Breadth of locations and types of similar projects – RANK	3	1	2	6	4	5
Customer satisfaction on similar projects – RANK	_____					
RANK (TOTAL)	6	3	3	12	9	9

OVERALL RANK/SCORE

	Lemoine	Brizo Const.	Dynamic Group	ESG Integrated Solutions	Garner Env. Services	LORA, Inc.
TOTAL SCORE – Combined Category Ranks	44	26	21	84	54	67
FINAL RANKING	3	2	1	6	4	5

Handwritten signature

SCORE SHEET BALLOT NAME *Charles J. ...*
 LDNR Project No. 431-PA23-002 – Shreveport District
 Orphaned Well Site Remediation and Restoration Management

- Following interviews of each responsive proposer, the Selection Review Committee Members will score each interviewed proposer as follows based on their written proposal and interview in each of the categories set forth in the RFQ.
- Each Selection Review Committee member is to score proposers on each of the subcategories of the four categories, by ranking each proposer in each subcategory. Scoring/ranking will be in ascending order with the lowest total score representing the best score (i.e. for each category best proposer = 1 point, second best = 2 points, etc).
- The scores by subcategory from all Selection Review Committee members will then be added together with the lowest score being ranked first for each category and the other proposals being ranked with the next lowest score being ranked second, and so on. Rankings for each category will then be added and the lowest overall score will be recommended for the Part A: Pre-site Restoration Services Contract award for the above referenced project.

History, organization, financial condition of firm and its team

	Lemoine	Brizo Const.	Dynamic Group	ESG Integrated Solutions	Garner Env. Services	LORA, Inc.
Business organization & history - RANK	2	3	1	6	4	6
Organizational structure - RANK	2	3	1	6	4	6
Financial condition & bonding capacity - RANK	2	3	1	6	4	6
Capacity to manage the volume & complexity of work - RANK	2	3	1	6	4	6
RANK (TOTAL)	8	12	4	24	16	24

Qualifications and staffing plan

	Lemoine	Brizo Const.	Dynamic Group	ESG Integrated Solutions	Garner Env. Services	LORA, Inc.
Experience of key personnel - RANK	2	3	1	6	4	5
Pre-site restoration phase staffing plans - RANK	2	3	1	6	4	5
Site-restoration phase staffing plans - RANK	2	3	1	6	4	5
RANK (TOTAL)	6	9	3	18	12	15

CLB

Approach and methodology

	Lemoine	Brizo Const.	Dynamic Group	ESG Integrated Solutions	Garner Env. Services	LORA, Inc.
Management Approach – Rank	2	3	1	5	4	6
Consistency of proposal with Key Project Values – RANK	2	3	1	5	4	6
Project organization – RANK	2	3	1	5	4	6
Experience with innovative delivery & procurement strategies – RANK	2	3	1	5	4	6
Unique capabilities/resources – RANK	2	3	1	5	4	6
RANK (TOTAL)	10	15	5	25	20	30

Past Performance on Similar Projects

	Lemoine	Brizo Const.	Dynamic Group	ESG Integrated Solutions	Garner Env. Services	LORA, Inc.
Experience on similar projects – RANK	2	3	1	6	4	5
Breadth of locations and types of similar projects – RANK	2	3	1	6	4	5
Customer satisfaction on similar projects – RANK	2		1			
RANK (TOTAL)	4	3	2	12	8	10

OVERALL RANK/SCORE

	Lemoine	Brizo Const.	Dynamic Group	ESG Integrated Solutions	Garner Env. Services	LORA, Inc.
TOTAL SCORE – Combined Category Ranks	28	42	14	79	56	29
FINAL RANKING	2	3	1	5	4	5